

TO: SUPERSEDED BY EI 79-020  
EFFECTIVE 5/31/1979

# ENGINEERING INSTRUCTION

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

SUBJECT: REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF CASE I AND II  
BIDS AND HIGH BID ITEMS

Subject Code: 7.30

Main Office     Regions     Special

Code: EI 77-54

Date: 11-30-77

Supersedes:

EI 73-17, 73-79, 77-9

APPROVED:



Jack Sternbach, Deputy Chief Engineer, Construction Subdivision

This Instruction outlines the review and evaluation process for Case I and II bids and high bid items from the time of bid opening to the recommendation of contract award to the State Comptroller, clarifies each individual organization or unit's responsibility in the process, and introduces new and time-saving changes to the process. These changes will become effective with the letting of 3/2/78.

The general events which constitute the review and evaluation process are: (1) After a bid opening occurs, all bids are verified, classified as Case I (less than or not more than 10% over the Engineer's Estimate) or Case II (more than 10% over the Engineer's Estimate) and processed by the Department's EDP Bidlet System. (2) The Bidlet System produces various reports which are then used in the award process. (3) The Construction Subdivision coordinates the necessary Regional and Main Office Units review of high bid items and Case II projects. (4) When the results of the various reviews are complete, the Construction Subdivision evaluates the review results and recommends either the award of the contract or the rejection of all bids.

## CHANGES - GENERAL

The first event which requires Region participation is the arrival of two reports generated by the Bidlet System. These two reports will be sent to each Region Office using the Department's computer night-time message delivery system. Therefore, it is imperative that the Region EDP terminal operator activate the Region's terminal at the start of business on the day after a letting so that these two reports will be received and delivered promptly. One report to be received by the Region will be a listing of every contract in the previous day's bid opening for that Region. This report will contain the Comptroller's Contract Number, the County, the Name of the Low Bidder, the Amount Bid, and when applicable, a Designation indicating the Contract is in the Case II category. This report requires two actions by the Region: (1) An identification of these Case II projects within the concerned Region. (2) A recommendation concerning award to the low bidders.

The other report to be received by the Region will be a listing of every contract within the Region which contains one or more Items bid more than 1.25 times the Engineer's Estimate. Following this list will be a contract by contract listing of all the Items in each contract that are more than 1.25 times the Engineer's Estimate. A combined listing of all the Regional transmissions will be sent to

Subject: REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF CASE I AND II BIDS AND HIGH BID ITEMS

the Structures Design and Construction Subdivision. The Contract Identification information which will precede each listing of high bid items will consist of the Contract Number, the PIN, County, Number of Bids, Low Bidder, and Bid Amount. Each high bid item will be identified by Item Number, Item Description, Unit, and Quantity. No information will be supplied about the Engineer's Estimated Unit Prices or the Contractor's Unit Bid Prices.

This report requires one action on the part of the Region: The verification of the estimated quantity for each item listed in the report.

As a result of these two new reports being issued automatically, the Regional offices will be expected to respond routinely to these reports and will no longer: (1) Receive a phone call or a terminal message from the Construction Subdivision, on the afternoon of the Letting, notifying them of the Apparent Low Bidder. (2) The Regions and the Structures Design and Construction Subdivision will no longer receive a written request (Form HC-180c) and an edited copy of the Comparison Report to initiate the review of High Bid Items.

#### LOW BIDDER REPORT - RECOMMENDATIONS & CASE II REVIEWS

The Construction Subdivision will assume that the Region recommends award of a Case I project to the Low Bidder if no response is received within 2 working days after the Region receives the Low Bidder Report. Since Bids are normally received on a Thursday and the list should be available in the Region early Friday morning, no response by the close of business on the following Monday will indicate to the Construction Subdivision that the Region approves of the Contractor. If, on the other hand, the Region has some objection to the Low Bidder or needs more time to evaluate the qualifications of the Low Bidder, it must transmit its objection, and a summary of the reasons for its objection, to the Construction Subdivision within two working days after receiving the Low Bidder Report. The message should be sent using the message service to the Construction Subdivision's Terminal Address, C070.

The response to a Case II project designation is due within 10 working days after the list is received. A Case II response shall consist of three parts: (1) A review of all estimated Item quantities to assure their reasonableness and accuracy. (2) A review of all High Bid Item quantities, which will be listed in the High Bid Items Report sent to the Regions the day after a Bid Opening. Each Quantity must be checked for reasonableness and accuracy as noted in (1) above, and, in addition, whenever possible, a site review is strongly recommended. Further discussion of this point will be deferred until the description of the High Bid Items Report. (3) A recommendation as to whether or not to award a Case II project. This recommendation should be based on the criteria found in M.A.P. 7.1-5, Criteria for Recommending Award of Contract for Highway and Bridge Construction Projects, Section IV Subsection B. Omit criteria, 1. f.g. and 2. a., b., h., because the information necessary to use them is not available to the Region. These criteria will be applied to the Case II projects by the Construction Subdivision. The Region's recommendation for award of a Case II project and the applicable Main Office Unit findings, will be combined and analyzed by the Construction Subdivision. After analysis the Construction Subdivision will prepare a recommendation for determination by the Assistant Commissioner of Transportation Operations. This recommendation will be prepared and submitted no later than 5 working days after all Regional and Main Office Units recommendations and findings have been returned to the Con-

Manual	Code 7.30	Date 11-30-77	Page 3
Subject: REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF CASE I AND II BIDS AND HIGH BID ITEMS			

struction Subdivision. This means, in general, no more than 15 working days should lapse between the Region's receipt of the two reports and a Final Recommendation being submitted on Case II projects. Until a decision is reached and the Contract is awarded, questions or requests for information regarding the disposition of a Case II project by the Low Bidder or other interested parties should be referred to the Contracts Bureau. No statements should be made by the Region as to what the final decision might be.

#### HIGH BID ITEMS REPORT

After receiving this Report, each High Bid Item within each contract, must be checked for reasonableness and accuracy. If the Region does not have the estimated quantity workup sheets needed to make an adequate review of the contract quantities because the project was designed by the Main Office Design Bureau or a consultant supervised by the Design Bureau or the Structures Subdivision, two choices are available to the Region. First, the Region may immediately notify the Construction Subdivision that it wishes to have the High Bid Items reviewed by the Design Bureau or the Structures Subdivision and the Construction Subdivision will proceed accordingly. Second, if the Region wishes to review the High Bid Item Report, it must make immediate arrangements with the Design Bureau or the Structures Subdivision to receive the information necessary to complete the review. The results of this check shall be transmitted to the Construction Subdivision no later than 5 working days after receipt (10 days for a Case II project). For a Thursday Letting, the response should be in the Construction Subdivision no later than the close of business on the following Thursday. Processing time will be reduced if the Region transmits the results of their High Bid Items review via the computer message service and transmitting 3 copies of the response. This can be done by typing the message address line as follows: (up arrow) C070, C070, C070. The Structures Design and Construction Subdivision's response, when necessary, will be transmitted via memo. The Structures Design and Construction Subdivision should inform the Construction Subdivision within 3 days after receipt of the High Bid Items Report as to which jobs in the Letting for which a response will be provided.

The purpose of the review of Unit Bid Price Quantities which are in excess of 25% above the Estimated Unit Prices is to detect any possible Quantity workup errors which could result in a windfall or a reversal in the position of the bidders when corrections are made to the Contract Quantities. The Region should also make an effort to verify the remaining items in the Contract for reasonableness and accuracy.

The importance of this review cannot be over-emphasized. Copies of the review are sent to the FHWA and the Comptroller's Office as part of the Final Award Process. Each of these Agencies places a great deal of weight on the Region's response when making their decision. In addition, Orders-on-Contracts and Final Agreements are carefully reviewed by both of these offices for Quantity Overruns in High Bid Items. Although minor upward adjustments in High Bid Items are tolerated, they are to be avoided; large adjustments are intolerable. Recently, the Department has been placed in the extremely embarrassing position of having a number of Contracts develop substantial Orders-on-Contracts within two months of the Award Date and finding that all of the items involved were High Bid Items which had been certified as being correct. This type of situation does harm to

Subject: REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF CASE I AND II BIDS AND HIGH BID ITEMS

the Department's reputation and credibility. It should also be borne in mind that this type of situation occurring early in the contract can lead to termination of the contract. Therefore, whenever possible, it is strongly urged that the high bid item review extend beyond the simple numerical checking of the estimated quantities and include a site review and consideration of items that may have been left out of the estimate or items that may have no place in the contract. It is obvious that this is quite a workload if one intends to accomplish it in the five working days allotted; a more reasonable approach might be to accomplish some of the necessary reviews between the time of advertisement and the receipt of bids.

#### IMPLEMENTATION

This new system will be operational with the letting of March 2, 1978. Although there is no reason to believe that there will be any problems, the Construction Subdivision will continue simultaneous operation of the old system for the lettings of 3/2/78 and 3/23/78. If no serious problems are encountered with the new system during the first two lettings, the operation of the old system will cease; and, thereafter, the new system will be the only system in effect. Should anyone fail to receive the required information or should any of the information transmitted appear to be erroneous, please call the Construction Subdivision immediately and report the problem.